Andri Jennings

"AO ,"

From:

Sent:

20 November 2020 02:20 PM Andri Jennings; Irene Pienaar

To: Cc:

'stefanie.fick'

Subject:

OUTA / SANRAL (PAIA - BAKWENA & TRAC)

Attachments:

Letter to OUTA 191120.PDF; 07_10_2020_COVER LETTER.pdf; ANNEXURE_OUTA_

3.2.pdf; ANNEXURE_OUTA_IA1.pdf; ANNEXURE_OUTA_IA2.pdf;

ANNEXURE_OUTA_IA3.1.pdf

Good day Andri,

1. I trust you are well.

- 2. Kindly find attached hereto the response received by SANRAL's attorneys in relation to OUTA's PAIA requests. As per the letter, it is confirmed that SANRAL will not necessarily oppose the applications, but will consider same upon receipt. This letter deals with OUTA's BAKWENA and TRAC applications.
- 3. For all practical purposes and should we accept internal appeal procedures as moot as per SANRAL's version, the basis for both applications to approach the court is that of a deemed refusal, irrespective of the fact that OUTA lodged internal appeals. For condonation purposes, note that in the case of a deemed refusal, calculation of the 180 day period in terms of sec 78 is to be calculated from the day upon which the response was due. SANRAL misconstrues sec 74, implying that their PAIA Manual supersedes the act in relation to internal appeals.
- 4. Kindly proceed to finalise the notice of motion and founding papers for both BAKWENA and TRAC. For practical purposes it may be best to place the matters on the roll for the same day, but I will leave that in your capable hands.
- 5. In addition, I attach hereto the relevant PAIA request(s) in relation to TRAC, set out chronologically as per the cover letter attached. Kindly note that we will tend to the necessary resolution as we did with Bakwena.
- 6. Feel free to give me a call should you require any clarity.

Kind Regards,

Brendan Slade Legal Project Manager

Email: brendan.slade@outa.co.za

Tel: 087 170 0639

Mobile: +27 83 298 7520 Web: www.outa.co.za



DELIVERED BY EMAIL

Organisation Undoing Tax Abuse NPC

Attention: Advocate Stephanie Fick Email: Stefanie.fick@outa.co.za Brendan.slade@outa.co.za

Johannesburg Office

The Central 96 Rivonia Road Sandton 2196 South Africa Private Bag 10015 Sandton 2146 Docex 111 Sandton

Tel +27 11 535 8000 Fax +27 11 535 8600 www.werksmans.com

YOUR REFERENCE: TR1712-016

OUR REFERENCE:

Ms S Moerane/SOUT3114.192/#7325767v1

DIRECT PHONE:

+27 11 535 8128

DIRECT FAX:

+27 11 535 8628

EMAIL ADDRESS:

smoerane@werksmans.com

19 November 2020

Dear Sirs

REQUEST FOR ACCESS TO INFORMATION IN TERMS OF THE PROMOTION OF ACCESS TO **INFORMATION ACT. 2000**

- 1 We refer to the abovementioned matter and your email dated 21 October 2020.
- 2 We have now had the opportunity to properly consider the PAIA requests, as well as the purported internal appeals.
- As you are aware, SANRAL has made a decision on the request dated 8 June 2020, and is deemed 3 to have made a decision on the request dated 25 August 2020. In both matters, it is therefore functus officio.
- While we note that OUTA has purported to lodge internal appeals in respect of both the abovementioned requests, no provision is made in the PAIA and in SANRAL's PAIA Manual for an internal appeal against SANRAL's decisions. In light of this, SANRAL will not make any decision on the purported internal appeals, as it is not empowered to do so.
- It is therefore open to OUTA to institute a review application in terms of section 78 of PAIA against 5 the decision(s).
- We do not anticipate that SANRAL will oppose any relief OUTA seeks reviewing and setting aside 6 its decision(s), however SANRAL will consider its position once it receives OUTA's application.

Werksmans Inc. Reg. No. 1990/007215/21 Registered Office The Central 96 Rivonia Road Sandton 2196 South Africa Werksmans Inc. Reg. No. 1990/007215/21 Registered Office The Central 96 Rivonia Road Sandton 2196 South Africa
Directors D Hertz (Chairman) OL Abraham C Andropoulos JKOF Antunes RL Armstrong DA Arteiro T Bata LM Becker JD Behr AR Berman NMN Bhengu Z Blieden HGB Boshoff
GT Bossr T J Boswell MC Brönn W Brown PF Burger PG Cleland JG Cloede PPJ Coetser C Cole-Morgan JN de Villiers R Driman D Gewer JA Gobetz R Gogtkin ID Gouws
GF Griessel N Harduth LD Hinxman J Hollesen MGH Honiball VR Hosiosky BB Hotz T Inno HC Jacobs TL Janse van Rensburg G Johannes S July J Kallmeyer A Kenny R Killoran
N Kirby HA Kotze S Krige PJ Krusche K Lalla P Ie Roux MM Lessing E Levenstein JS Lochner K Louw JS Lubbe BS Mabasa PK Mabaso DD Magidson MPC Manaka JE Meiring
H Michael SM Moerane C Moraitis PM Mosebo NPA Motsiri L Naidoo A Ngidi JJ Niemand BPF Olivier WE Oosthuizen S Padayachy M Pansegrouw S Passmoor
D Pisanti T Potter BC Price AA Pyzikowski RJ Raath A Ramdhin MDF Rodrigues BR Roothman W Rosenberg NL Scott TA Sibidla FT Sikhavhakhavha LK Sibarman S Sinden
DE Singo JA Smit BM Sono Cl Stevens PO Steyn J Stockwell JG Theron PW Tindle SA Tom JJ Truter KJ Trudgeon DN van den Berg AA van der Menwe HA van Niekerk
JJ van Niekerk FJ van Tonder JP van Wyk A Vatalidis RN Wakefield DC Walker L Watson D Wegierski G Wickins M Wiehahn DC Willans DE Williams
W Woorkman-Davies Consultant DH Rabin JJ van Niekerk FJ van Tonder JP van Wyk BW Workman-Davies Consultant DH Rabin



7 SANRAL's rights remain reserved.

Yours faithfully

Werksmans Attorneys
THIS LETTER HAS BEEN ELECTRONICALLY TRANSMITTED WITH NO SIGNATURE.





Unit 4, Boskruin Village Office Park Cnr President Fouche & Hawken Road Bromhof, 2188 Tel: 087 170 0639 Email: info@outa.co.za

5 October 2020

Attention:

The Information / Deputy Information Officer

The South African National Roads Agency Limited

48 Tambotie Avenue

Val de Grace Pretoria 0184

Email:

info@nra.co.za

macozomas@nra.co.za

louwk@nra.co.za NgobeniS@nra.co.za motaungh@nra.co.za LindaS@nra.co.za

Dear Sir/Madam,

REQUEST FOR ACCESS TO INFORMATION IN TERMS OF THE PROMOTION OF ACCESS TO INFORMATION ACT, 2000 ("PAIA") – FORM A OUR REF: TR 1712-016

- 1. We refer to the above.
- 2. The Organisation Undoing Tax Abuse ("OUTA") is a proudly South African non-profit civil action organisation, comprising of and supported by people who are passionate about improving the prosperity of our nation. OUTA was established to challenge the abuse of authority, in particular the abuse of taxpayers' money.
- 3. Kindly find attached hereto our notice of internal appeal (Form B) in terms of section 74(1) of PAIA in response to your deemed refusal to our request for access to information, as well as the relevant annexure thereto, marked **ANNEXURE** "OUTA_IA1" and "OUTA_IA2" respectively.
- 4. For ease of reference, we also attach hereto our request for access to information as submitted on 25 August 2020, marked **"OUTA_IA3"**.
- 5. Kindly contact our Mr Brendan Slade at <u>brendan.slade@outa.co.za</u> in the event of any queries.
- 6. We trust that you find the above in order and look forward to receiving your response.
- 7. Kindly acknowledge receipt of this letter.





Unit 4, Boskruin Village Office Park Cnr President Fouche & Hawken Road Bromhof, 2188 Tel: 087 170 0639

Email: info@outa.co.za

Yours Sincerely,

Stefanie Fick

Executive Director of the Accountability Division

OUTA - Organisation Undoing Tax Abuse

Email: stefanie.fick@outa.co.za

"ANNEXURE X"

Information sought:

Information relating to the upgrade of the N4 route from the Solomon Mahlangu Drive Interchange towards the Maputo Port (Mozambique), as specified below:

PART A:

- 1. A copy of the Concession Contract, for a portion of National Route N4 (toll route) running from the City of Tshwane towards to the Maputo Port, entered into between the South African National Road Agency Limited ("SANRAL") and Trans African Concessions ("TRAC"), hereinafter referred to as the "TRAC Concession Contract":
- 2. A copy of all Annexures and Addenda to the TRAC Concession Contract;
- 3. A copy of all <u>Amendments and Addenda</u> (if any) to the TRAC Concession Contract;
- A copy of all Operation and Maintenance contracts entered into between the Concessionaire and the O&M Contractors, relating to the TRAC Concession Contract;
- A copy of the Operational and Maintenance Manual pertaining to the TRAC Concession Contract;
- 6. A copy of the contracts entered into with the Independent Engineer(s), pertaining to the TRAC Concession Contract:
- 7. A copy of all the Independent Engineer(s) Reports submitted to SANRAL, pertaining to the TRAC Concession Contract;
- 8. A copy of all Construction Work contracts entered into by the Concessionaire relating to the TRAC Concession Contract;

Page **1** of **2**

- A copy of all "Performance Certificates" issued, relating to the Construction Works contracts entered into by the Concessionaire (as referred to in item 8, above);
- 10. A copy of all "Taking Over certificates" that have been issued in terms of the TRAC Concession Contract;

PART B:

- Copies of TRAC's complete financial statements for each fiscal year, submitted to SANRAL in terms of the TRAC Concession Contract (as from 1999/2000 financial year to present);
- Copies of all reconciliations of TRAC's Profit & Loss Accounts, together with their proposed budgets for each fiscal year, submitted to SANRAL, from 1999/2000 fiscal year to present in terms of the TRAC Concession Contract;
- Copies of all Annual Reports submitted to SANRAL, pertaining to the TRAC Concession Contract (as from the 1999/2000 financial year to present), issued by TRAC's appointed auditors, certifying that the computation of the Highway Usage Fee for the previous year was correctly calculated; and
- 4. Copies of the lists, submitted to SANRAL in terms of the TRAC Concession Contract (as from 1999 to present), of TRAC's lenders and creditors to which TRAC owes a sum in excess of the equivalent of R10 000 000 (ten million Rand), including the amounts due to each of them.

GROUNDS FOR INTERNAL APPEAL

A BACKGROUND

- The Organisation Undoing Tax Abuse ("OUTA") hereby lodges an internal appeal
 in terms of section 74(1) of the Promotion of Access to Information Act, 2000
 ("PAIA") the South African National Roads Agency Ltd's ("SANRAL") to grant
 OUTA access to the records it requested in terms of a request for access to
 information, submitted on 25 August 2020.
- 2. Notwithstanding OUTA's request for access to information, SANRAL failed to provide OUTA with a formal response to the request as contemplated in section 25(1) of PAIA. Furthermore, SANRAL also failed to request an extension of this (seeking extension of an additional 30 days for consideration of OUTA's request) in terms of section 26 of PAIA. Accordingly, OUTA's internal appeal is justified in terms of section 74 of PAIA.
- 3. In terms of section 27 of PAIA, SANRAL failure to provide OUTA with a formal response may be deemed as a refusal to such request. SANRAL further failed to set out its grounds for refusal as contemplated in Chapter 4 of PAIA.
- 4. In terms of section 11(1) of PAIA, a requestor must be given access to a record of a public body if the requestor has complied with all procedural requirements prescribed by PAIA and access to the records is not refused on any ground as listed in Chapter 4 of PAIA.
- OUTA further submits that it has substantially complied with all procedural requirements as stipulated in section 18 of PAIA, and such, it is entitled to be granted access to the records as requested.

Page 1 of 1



REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

FORM A REQUEST FOR ACCESS TO RECORD OF PUBLIC BODY (Section 18(1) of the Promotion of Access to Information Act, 2000 (Act No. 2 of 2000)) [Regulation 6]

FOR DEPARTMENT	TAL USE	
	Reference numl	ber:
Request received by	/	(state rank,
name and surname	of information officer/deputy information officer) on	(date)
at		(place).
Request fee (if any):	R	
Deposit (if any):	R	
Access fee:	R	
SIGNATURE OF INF	FORMATION OFFICER/DEPUTY INFORMATION OFFICER	

A. Particulars of public body

The Information Officer/Deputy Information Officer

THE SOUTH AFRICAN NATIONAL ROADS AGENCY LIMITED 48 TAMBOTIE AVENUE VAL DE GRACE PRETORIA 0184

B. Particulars of person requesting access to the record

(a) The particulars of the pe(b) The address and/or fax(c) Proof of the capacity in v	number	in the	Republ	ic to wh	ich the	informa	ation is	to be s	ent, mu	ıst be	given.		
	CTEE	ADITE I	CICK	e									
Full names and surname:	SIEF	ANIE I	ick						•••••				•••••
Identity number:	7	4	0	1	1	9	0	0	1	4	0	8	7
Postal address:	N/A												
Telephone number:	()												
E-mail address: stefanie.fick@outa.co.za													
Capacity in which request is	made,	when	made o	n beha	lf of and	other pe	erson:						
HEAD OF THE ACCOUNT	ABILITY	Y DIVI	SION: T	THE OR	GANIS.	ATION	UNDOI	NG TA	X ABU	SE (OU	JTA)		
C. Particulars of person on	whose	e beha	If requ	est is m	nade								
This section must be comple	eted ON	NLY if a	reque	st for in	formation	on is ma	ade on	behalf (of anot	ner pe	rson.		
	THE	ODCA	NICATI	ON LINI	DOING	TANA	DUCE						
Full names and surname:	ne	URGA	NISAII	ON UNI	DOING	IAA A	DUSE.					•••••	
Identity number:													
D. Particulars of record													
(a) Provide full particulars to you, to enable the re (b) If the provided space must sign all the additional control of the co	ecord to is inade	be loc equate,	cated.					-					
Description of record or re SEE ATTACHED HERETO "	ANNEX	URE X	"										

FORM A: REQUEST FOR ACCESS TO RECORD OF PUBLIC BODY

2. Reference	e number, if available: $$				
3. Any furthe	er particulars of record:				
SEE ATTAC	CHED HERETO "ANNEXURI	E X''			
E. Fees					
proce (b) You w (c) The fe	ssed only after a request feed ill be notified of the amount are payable for access to a red to search for and prepared	e has be required record of a reco	en paid. I to be paid as the request fee epends on the form in which	e. access is	formation about yourself, will be required and the reasonable time rexemption.
Reason for e	exemption from payment of	fees:			
N/A					
					••••••
If you are pr	access to record evented by a disability to re sability and indicate in which			form of a	ccess provided for in 1 to 4 below
Disability:	N/A				Form in which record is required:
Mark the a	opropriate box with an X .				ELECTRONIC
NOTES: (a) Complia available		ccess in	the specified form may depen	nd on the f	orm in which the record is
	in the form requested may be will be granted in another for		ed in certain circumstances. Ir	such a ca	ase you will be informed if
			any, will be determined partly	by the for	m in which access is requested.
1 If the rec	ord is in written or printed fo	ırm.			
X	copy of record*		inspection of record		
2. If record	consists of visual images -			E0007 W	
(this include			ings, computer-generated images*	ages, sket	
	view the images	X	copy of the images*		transcription of the images*

FORM A: REQUEST FOR ACCESS TO RECORD OF PUBLIC BODY

3. If record	consists of recorded words of	or inform	nation which can be reproduced	in sour	nd:		
	listen to the soundtrack (audio cassette)	X	transcription of soundtrack* (written or printed document)				
4. If record	is held on computer or in an	electro	nic or machine-readable form:				
	printed copy of record*		printed copy of information derived from the record*	X	copy in computer readable form* (stiffy or compact disc)		
	n to be posted to you?	ı of a re	cord (above), do you wish the co	opy or	YES	NO	X
Note that if record is a		the lan	guage you prefer, access may b	e gran	ted in the lang	uage in whic	ch the
In which la	nguage would you prefer the	record'	? ENGLISH				
You will be manner, pl	ease specify the manner and	our requ I provid	uest has been approved / denied e the necessary particulars to er	nable co	ompliance with	your reque	
-	ou prefer to be informed of t ICALLY - EMAIL	he deci	sion regarding your request for a	access	to the record?		
Signed at	COODEPOORT		this day 25TH of AU	GUST		yea	2020
					Tuk		
			SIGNATURE O	E REOI	JESTER/		
			PERSON ON W			QUEST IS M	ADE